



National Business Education  
Accreditation Council  
[www.nbeac.org.pk](http://www.nbeac.org.pk)



# Strengthening Business Schools through Partnerships



# REPORT

17<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Feb 2016  
Pearl Continental, Lahore

# Strengthening Business Schools through Partnerships



# REPORT



National Business Education  
Accreditation Council  
[www.nbeac.org.pk](http://www.nbeac.org.pk)



# CONTENTS

- 01 Organizing Committee
- 02 Conference Overview
- 04 Inaugural Session
- 08 Session 1:  
Essential Components of Strategic Plan
- 10 Session 2: Roles and Responsibilities of  
Business School's Teachers; Student's Perspective
- 12 Session 3:  
Hiring and Motivating Qualified Faculty
- 15 Session 4:  
Visioning the Future of Business Education: Global Perspectives
- 17 Session 5:  
Industry Expectations from the Business Graduates
- 21 Session 6:  
Making Business Schools more relevant for the Industry -  
Challenges and Opportunities for forging Linkages and  
Partnerships
- 24 Roundtable Session 1:  
Unique Challenges of Rural/Remote Universities
- 26 Roundtable Session 2:  
How to Cultivate a Research Culture in Business Schools?
- 27 Roundtable Session 3:  
Unique Challenges for Public Sector Universities
- 28 Roundtable Session 4:  
Quality assurance in Public Administration
- 29 Roundtable Session 5:  
The Crises and Challenges of Commerce Education
- 30 Workshop I: Engaging your faculty in Management  
Consulting; Benefits to the Business Schools and the faculty
- 31 Workshop II: Developing Entrepreneurs;  
Refining the Curriculum and Guiding your Faculty
- 32 Closing session

## Organizing Committee

### NBEAC Team

1. **Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja**, Program Director, NBEAC
2. **Ms. Sania Tufail**, Program Manager, NBEAC
3. **Ms. Nomeeta Maqsood**, IT Officer, NBEAC
4. **Ms. Fatima Kamran**, Management Trainee Officer, NBEAC
5. **Mr. Ahmed Hassan**, Management Trainee Officer, NBEAC
6. **Mr. Asad Khan**, Internee (Accounts), NBEAC

### Key Members

1. **Dr. Hasan Sohaib Murad**, Chairman, NBEAC
2. **Dr. Zahoor Hassan Syed**, Professor, LUMS
3. **Dr. Sadia Nadeem**, Associate Professor, FAST School of Management, FAST NU, Islamabad
4. **Dr. Abdus Sattar Abbasi**, HoD Management Sciences, COMSATS Institute of IT, Lahore
5. **Dr. Ali Sajid, Professor**, University of Lahore
6. **Dr. Ijaz A. Qureshi**, Dean Lahore Business School, University of Lahore
7. **Dr. Dawood Mamoon**, Assistant Professor, University of Management Technology, Lahore
8. **Dr. Rana Ayyub**, Chairman Department of Economics & Business Management, University of Animal and Veterinary Sciences, Lahore
9. **Dr. Fareeda Saleem**, HoD, Business Administration, FJWU, Rawalpindi
10. **Dr. Fouzia Ali**, Assistant Professor, Hailey College of Commerce, University of Punjab, Lahore
11. **Dr. Abdus Sattar Abbasi**, HoD, COMSATS Institute of IT, Lahore
12. **Dr. Asma Imran**, Assistant Professor, COMSATS Institute of IT, Lahore
13. **Mr. Ibrahim Qazi**, Executive Secretary to Rector University of Management & Technology, Lahore
14. **Ms. Amna Anjum**, RO, University of Management & Technology, Lahore
15. **Mr. Haris**, Research Associate, University of Management & Technology, Lahore
16. **Mr. Ali Asghar**, Research Fellow, University of Management & Technology, Lahore
17. **Ms. Arsala**, Research Associate, University of Management & Technology, Lahore
18. **Mr. Daniyal**, Social Media representative, University of Management & Technology, Lahore
19. **Mr. Shehzad Ali**, Vibrant Communications
20. **Mr. Shahid Hameed**, ARE Travels

### Transcribers

1. **Ms. Sania Tufail**, Program Manager, NBEAC
2. **Vibrant Communications**

### Reviewers

1. **Dr. Farooq-e-Azam Cheema**, NBEAC member & Dean Bahria University, Karachi Campus
2. **Mr. Ahtesham Ali Raja**, Program Director, NBEAC

## Conference Overview



National Business Education Accreditation Council (NBEAC) was established by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) in 2007 with the purpose to assure quality in business education degree programs. It is a national level accrediting authority which organizes and carries out comprehensive accreditations. Accreditation is market-driven and has an international focus. It assesses the characteristics of an Institution and its programmes against a set of criteria. It signifies that the Institutional performance is based on assessment carried out through an independent competent body of quality assessors, with strengths and weaknesses emanating as a feedback for policy-making.

The conference **“Strengthening Business Schools through Partnerships”** was the third of the series of four strategic level conferences that provided a platform for deans, directors and heads of business schools to interact with each other and with industry professionals. The key objectives of the conference were:

- i. To strengthen the business schools through industry academia partnerships.**
- ii. To suggest ways to enhance research activities in business schools through partnerships.**
- iii. To provide focused recommendations to the business schools for enhancing employability skills of business graduates.**
- iv. To strengthen business schools through sharing ideas, resources and infrastructure.**

The desirable outcomes of the conference were to identify the critical steps for aligning education with business needs and to identify and recommend actions to the emerging challenges in business education.

Out of 180 Business Schools nationwide, Deans and Directors of 160 Business Schools participated in the conference along with the international representatives from 15 business schools from USA, UK, Canada, Switzerland, Russia, Malaysia, SAARC countries etc. Besides, more than 500 faculty members from the Business Schools, and 100 industry experts participated in the conference. The conference was inaugurated by the American Consul General, Zachary V. Harkenrider.

The conference was a venue for experience sharing based on the discussions and perspectives of business school heads, industry professionals and entrepreneurs. The strategic conference provided a platform for the participants to share their experiences in establishing linkages and fruitful contributions made to the development of business education, industry and economy. Prominent speakers from around the globe and country shared ground breaking ideas.

Distinguished speakers from academia included: Dr. Ishrat Husain (Dean & Director, IBA), Dr. Syed Zahoor Hassan (Professor, LUMS), Professor Ralf Boscheck (MBA Program Director, IMD, Switzerland),

Dr. Christophe Terrasse (Director Projects, EFMD, Belgium), Prof Dr Zaher Zain(Dean, The University of Malaysia), Dr. Nauman Farooqi (HoD, Mount Allison University , Canada), Prof. Konstantin Krotov( Managing Director, St. Petersburg University, Russia), Prof. Kerry L. Laufer(Director, Tuck School of Business at Dartmouth, USA), Prof. F. Robert Wheeler ( Founding Dean , KSBL), Mr. Javed Hamid(Senior Advisor, International Executive Service Corps, Washington DC, USA) Dr. Ehsan ul Haq (Dean, Suleman Dawood School of Business LUMS).

Eminent speakers from Industry included: Mr. Agha Zafar Abbas(CEO, KANSAL Paints), Mr. Sajjad Kirmani (CEO, Infogistic), Mr. Arif Ijaz(Advisor to CEO, Maple Leaf Cement co), Mr. Osman Khalid Waheed(President, Ferozsons Laboratories Limited, Pakistan), Mr. Omar Saeed (CEO, Service Industries Limited), Mr. Adeel Anwar(Director at Warid Telecom, Lahore), Mr. Ali Khurram

Pasha(Head of Strategy & Leadership Development, Bank Alfalah), Dr. Faheem-ul-Islam(Member, Ministry of Planning, Development & Reforms, Islamabad) Mr. Mohammed Ali Khan(Senior Education Specialist, International Finance Corporation, USA), Ms. Shahbano Hameed (Head Corporate Solutions, EasyPaisa, Telenor, Pakistan) and many more. The conference concluded on a positive note. Syed Babar Ali was the chief guest in the closing ceremony.

The conference program was apportioned into six plenary sessions, five breakout sessions and two workshops were conducted in the two day conference. The key actionable message from many of the conference sessions was the importance of presence with regard to business schools to manage both governance and quality issues, openness to the world in order to reach out to others for global assistance and human resource development as there is a great need to work and collaborate together.

## Inaugural Session:



Form L to R: Mr. Muhammad Yahya Khan, Chief Financial Services Officer of Easypaisa, Telenor, Islamabad, Dr. Christophe Terrasse, Director Projects, European Fund for Management Development (EFMD), Belgium, Dr. Ishrat Hussain, Professor Emeritus and Chairman Centre for Excellence in Islamic Finance, IBA Karachi, Mr. Rana Mashhood Ahmad Khan, Education Minister of Punjab, Mr. Zachary V. Harkenrider, US Consul General, Dr. Hasan Sohaib Murad, Chairman, NBEAC, Dr. Shahid Amjad Chaudhry, Rector, Lahore School of Economics (LSE), Dr. Mohammad Jasimuddin, Executive member of AMDISA

- NBEAC laid down an elaborate system for quality assurance in the Business Schools in Pakistan and aims to strengthen cooperation among important stakeholders such as Corporate Sector, Academia and Government for making Business Schools more relevant for the needs of the country.
- The need of introspection among the stakeholders; the interests of the stakeholders (Corporate Sector and Academia). Presently, they do not co-align with each other at the moment. Corporate Sector is concerned with maximization of profits and Academia is concerned about publications; disconnect is apparent. However, NBEAC intends to bring all stakeholders on the same page; to encourage them to revisit their priorities and obligations towards each other.
- The phenomenon of Internationalization; the need to create (international-minded) leaders and professionals.
- Connections in the global environment (among Business Schools) are necessary to produce graduates that can meet global challenges and facilitate internationalization or similar objective.
- Federal Government of Pakistan is committed to uplift the standards of education in Pakistan; cooperation of University of London (UK) in this endeavor officially sought.
- Business Schools are increasing in number with passage of time in Pakistan, thanks in part to governmental commitment in this regard.
- Telenor is planning to launch digitalized fee collection and salary disbursement procedures within the education sector of Pakistan through its Easypaisa initiative.

The session commenced with the recitation from the Holy Quran followed by the welcome address by the Chairman NBEAC, Dr. Hasan Sohaib Murad. He hoped to have the great event full of exuberance, intellectual discussions, invigorating thought process and a creative reflection on where we stand, how we should go where we want to go and what should be the best course of action. He, wholeheartedly thanked the participants and sponsors of the conference, especially the huge support extended by the Quality Assurance Agency of Higher Education Commission. Dr. Hasan also thanked Chairman Higher Education Commission with the assurance that the provided resources are utilized very well. He mentioned the AMDISA executive board meeting associated with this



event. But unfortunately due to visa issue a dozen of SAARC members could not be able to arrive on time. Dr. Hasan wished all participants to have a purposeful conference ahead.

Dr. Shahid Amjad Chaudhry, Rector of LSE, welcomed the participant on behalf of Association of Management Development in Pakistan (AMDIP). He related the role of Deans and Directors in a Business School with the economic growth of the country. He explained that Pakistan is the world's eighteenth largest economy in purchasing power as mentioned in World Banks' report of 2011. When compared our GDP of about a trillion dollar today with the 850 billion dollar in 2011, along with the population of 200 million people, we are substantiated to be the significant players on the world scene. Similarly, within the Pakistan, Business Schools are the significant player as the universities contribute almost a billion dollar equivalent or much more in terms of resources. And within the Universities, the Dean and Directors considered as the most authoritative designation controlled over the vast intellectual and financial resources of the academic unit. Thus playing a significant role to utilize the intellectual power in order to bring a powerful situation. The Deans and Directors collectively represent a resourceful community that needs to work on three parameters:

- i. Individual Presence
- ii. Openness to the world
- iii. Human Resource Development

While discussing individual and financial governance, he mentioned that quality and governance are hard tasks to do and are significantly weaker area in the country as well as in the institutions. It seems ridiculous if a country opens less than 20% of its economy to the world. It's a matter of fact that as a country or institutions, we are not open to the world. Although security conditions do not allow us to invite foreign students but it is also a real fact that our faculty and students are inward looking that reflect upon the weakness at country's and institution's level. We should made effort to reach out. He emphasized that there is a need to focus on student and faculty development equally. To handle all these issues, HEC, Government, NBEAC and the Business Institution need to work together. As AMDIP is linked with AMDISA and some foreign universities, he assured support from the AMDIP platform in this regard. To develop HR, AMDIP has started own series of conferences and workshops for lecturers and assistant professors as well.

Dr. Ishrat Hussain appreciated NBEAC for continuously holding Deans and Directors conference

every year. He said that the tradition is not only being kept up but is strengthened with the attendance as third conference is much larger than 1st and 2nd conferences. He anticipated that in future NBEAC Deans and Directors conference would be the platform for reflections upon the quality and access of the Business Education. He said that instead of pretending everything in hunky-dory state and self-congratulating ourselves, we should ask hard questions and try to find solutions if this will lead us to achieve our objectives and goals. He shared the concepts of relevance, disconnects and tradeoffs in the Business Education. He explained that academia including HEC considers rigor, responsibility and relevance as a major objective which we should try to achieve in our business schools. But this is not a linear combination and this is not without some tradeoffs and cost. He referred to the examples of faculty members who are getting their research publications in indexed journals which can help them to achieve academic excellence. But problems related to the society, the economy, the businesses and public/private sector could not be addressed in such researches. This, creates the disconnect between the incentive structure of the faculty and pegging of the real world problems where the intellect from Business Schools is not applied to find the solutions of the problems related to health ,education ,agricultural and other critical issues. Regarding responsibilities, he clarified that most of the business schools are still doing profit maximization and most of the consumers are doing utility maximization. However, the global mega trends with timely changing incoming qualities indicate that there is a triple bottom-line instead of profit making. It comprises of profits, people and planning which means environmental sustainability at social equality have to be mixed with the profitability. Here the question arises, are we teaching our students to focus on this triple bottom-line? No, we are still following the text books and articles which are motivated by the same philosophy of profit maximization and utility maximization. On the subject of relevance, he explained that most of the graduates aspire to work in multinational corporations. The multinational corporations already have their own system and procedures in place, therefore, the room for maneuverability and to move within the productivity is very limited. They should be working in Pakistani companies, on family owned businesses where productivity gains are quiet larger. But very few people go to these family owned businesses because they do not have the career structure. They do not have compensation mechanism and suitable working environment. As a result, the best produced talent

working marginally on the periphery of the multinational corporations. While we have companies which are not performing so well but having the potential to perform well if they are served by the best talent available. He mentioned that every business school has started the executive MBA program as a profit making enterprise. Only the large business houses can approach these programs due to affordability issue. The public sector enterprise like PIA, steel mill etc. cannot afford to pay the same prices but they need training in finance, HR and logistics management. Business Schools should hold training courses for the executives of public sector enterprises as well as for NGOs as they become a much larger segment of our development process. If business schools can enhance the capabilities they can deliver much better job. But here is the dilemma and tradeoff due to the money making model of the business schools. As Deans or Director, it's our responsibility to face these challenges, work on them and find solutions. Otherwise, we would have rituals of these conferences daily, annually and congratulate ourselves. We as a responsible citizens have to change our attitudes. We must find the solutions to the practical problems faced by the country.

Dr. Mohammad Jasimuddin, Executive member of AMDISA, explained the responsibilities of the civil servants in ensuring collaboration between Corporate Sector, Government and Academia to achieve objectives mutually. He explained that the South Asian region has a huge intellectual potential that is untapped. The governments do not allow its citizens to travel freely. So he created a concept paper on AMDISA wherein 2nd track diplomacy could work. The idea was to bring together the potential of all south Asian countries together. Finally he made it. AMDISA got recognized by SAARC secretariat, one of the premier institutions to help develop capacity in the region. His background as head of governance and institutional development at the common wealth secretariat helped him learn from more developed common wealth countries and to bring them into today's theme "the strengthening partnerships in this region". While working with Dr. Ishrat Hussain's predecessor, he brought the bank of England to Lahore amid the crisis regarding shutting down of BCCI and their friends in Pakistan were eager to know the political reasons behind bank of England. He worked closely with administrative college Lahore aiming at bringing the public policy executives from the common wealth countries and learn from the Pakistan experience. He also worked with Pakistan academy for rural development taking it closer to other academies of Asia and Africa. Business schools

have potential which has not been fully realized. When LUMS was being established they asked the AMDISA to link those developed countries of common wealth and AMDISA facilitated them in this regard. He thinks that developed world should get linked with countries like Pakistan for guidance purposes. They started Common Wealth Post-Doctoral fellowship through AMDISA. There have been some notable recipients of this program in Pakistan and other countries but sadly that program has ended. The new secretary general is expected to take his charge in near future so it is hoped that Pakistan will try getting in touch with him in this regard. Management development institutions are of greater importance. Dr. Shahid can be helpful in linking up with the said institutions. Interestingly, these institutions are interested in learning from Pakistan as developing nation. He believed the institutions of developed world will be happy coming to Pakistan and bring their academia and experience. He conveyed his best wishes and thanks to NBEAC for having him here.

Dr. Christophe Terrasse, Director Projects of EFMD, introduced the phenomenon of Internationalization; He started with the introduction of EFMD and informed that EFMD is an international network of business schools and universities. When it comes to creating good managers and leaders he thinks that the education at academic institutions needs to be based on international approach. The industry also looks for graduates who have been exposed to education which has international outlook. So internationalization is of the essence in terms of business education. But the question is how can we make it possible? The second question is can we bring internationalization quickly a part of business education; the answer is no. He stressed the audience that we should first know what is not internationalization?. He explained that having people from different countries at a campus is not the true concept to achieve internationalization. Teaching in English medium is not enough to be called internationalization. Internationalization is basically a tool to learn from the experiences of other countries. The ultimate goal of internationalization must be kept in mind. Internationalization is based on research. We really need to know what we are heading to and moreover internationalization is a process that takes some time to happen. It also needs pumping in of resources. Faculty, students and other stakeholders should be taken on board for internationalization.

Mr. Javed Hamid, Senior Advisor at IESC, asserted that connections in the global environment (among Business Schools) are necessary to produce

graduates that can meet global challenges and establish a global business network. Global business school network is reputed organization which has around 70 members from developed and developing countries around the globe including 04 business schools from Pakistan. It basically connects the faculty and students of the business schools to each other. These connections are made through interactive activities like faculty visits, conferences and workshops etc. It's very simple to get connected to this organization through its website.

Mr. Rana Mashhood Ahmad Khan, Education Minister of Punjab, conveyed the perspective of Federal government to the audience vis-à-vis central theme. He pointed out that the Federal Government of Pakistan is committed to improve the quality of education in the country and Business Schools are increasing in number with passage of time as a consequence. Honorable Chief Minister of the Punjab, Shahbaz Sharif visited UK in December 2015 and signed an agreement with the University of London to play a role in uplifting the standards of education in Pakistan. We have entrepreneurs, industry people, and faculties from 80 business schools, SAARC delegates here and I welcome you all. The management education in Pakistan has come of age. Thanks to international business education accreditation council under the visionary leadership of Professor Doctor Hasan Murad who himself is the Rector of a well reputed university in Lahore. This is the third in a series of four such conferences. The collaboration of HEC mandated by the Chairman Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed makes it a powerful commentary on public private convergence for excellence in education. Government's commitment of ensuring higher education has been commend by accreditation council. We have over 100 business schools on the country although it is not very encouraging but it indicates that we are working in this sector. Demand of business graduates reflects growth of industry. Knowledge economy under shadows of globalization is likely put heavier demands on our business education. Constant innovation will be the order of the day. IT is growing on higher pace and forcing us to make rapid adjustments. The betterment of business schools is of immense significance. Punjab government is working on teachers training at large. We have signed an agreement with university of London for teachers training program. We are running 54,000 schools across Punjab. 5,000 of them are not delivering so we are going for public private partnership. We have introduced a new concept of knowledge power based on research-academia- industry nexus.

Mr. Muhammad Yayha Khan, CFO at Easypaisa, explained the accomplishments of Easypaisa initiative and its plan to introduce fee collection and salary disbursement within the education sector through digital avenues. It is an innovative mobile banking service. He said that academicians are the change agents. All the big change agents in the world are visionary in their thoughts.

Finally, Mr. Zachary Harkenrider, the current US Consulate General in Pakistan, conveyed the perspective of the American government to the audience. He exhorted the organizers of the conference to recognize the vital role that education plays in building the future generations of entrepreneurs and business professionals. He shared that United States Govt. recognizes the strong economic growth depends upon strong education system. That is why there is increase in financial and IT resources to utilize latest technology in management practices. He mentioned two programs of US Govt. to support higher education institutions in Pakistan.

1. University partnerships and academia linkages- US Govt. initiative to build interaction between Pakistan and US academic institutions having specific academic focus. Currently, there are eight projects running in Punjab only with the combined value of Rs. 09 millions. In this program, the American universities help the Pakistani universities to build their curriculums and provide pedagogical trainings in this regard.
2. International visitor trade ship program and the Fulbright program- US connecting professionals of both countries in making both nations stronger.

He also mentioned few other programs like Pak-US Alumni networks, US-Pak access to credit through which USAID partnerships with four Pakistani banks to provide 6000 businesses with access to 60 million dollars in loan over the next seven years. He also stated about USAID need based and merit scholarships program currently running in 31 Pakistani universities. He ended up with his belief to take off PAK-US partnership at prime level in next decade. He assured that both nations have to work hard towards partnership between our diplomats, our foreign commercial services etc. Deans and Directors will help in finding ways for business ties and trade between Pak and US and yield something promising through bilateral relations.

## Session 1: Essential Components of Strategic Plan

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
<b>Dr. Zahoor Hassan Syed</b>	Professor, Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS)
<b>Dr. Ishrat Husain</b>	Director, Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi.
<b>Prof. Ralf Boscheck</b>	MBA program Director, International Institute for Management Development (IMD), Switzerland
<b>Dr. Zaher Zain</b>	Dean, Graduate School of Business, Universiti Kebangsaan, Malaysia
<b>Dr. Christophe Terrasse</b>	Director Projects, European Foundation for Management Development (EFMD), Belgium

- Importance of Business Model to prepare the Business Schools' strategy
- Importance of strategic planning
- Involvement of stakeholders while preparing strategy
- Importance of monitoring and evaluation while executing the strategy
- Revision of mission and vision after every five years to prosper
- Preparing students for civil society
- Sustainability of Business Schools

The session was moderated by Dr. Zahoor Hassan Syed. First keynote speaker, Prof. Dr. Ralf Boscheck has discussed the idea of navigating the business of business education involving some general imperatives and fundamental challenges. While sharing about IMD, Switzerland, he explained how IMD has academicians from industry. He also shared that there are no tenure track systems and departmental silos at IMD. Some key questions were presented before audience to navigate the business of business education.

- i. What is your Business Model?
- ii. How do you define the industry you are in and which of its markets do you make your business to serve?
- iii. What determines your margin potential?
- iv. Which assets, capabilities and systems are vital for continuing the model's success?
- v. Which parts of the operations can be outsourced and effectively controlled through markets or incentives?
- vi. Where does market create leverages and where unnecessary exposure?
- vii. Which parts need to be controlled through ownership and how do you organize internal operations with market requirements?

viii. Which forces may challenge the sustainability of this business model?

Prof. Ralf asserted that internationalization is a poorly understood phenomenon. According to him, internationalization is a way to enhance the quality of education, research and service to society. Its measures include achieving credibility in the international market, developing cross-border relevance, attracting students & faculty from other countries, delivering programs up to international standards, preparing graduates for international management, and maintaining academic and corporate links abroad. Prof Ralf emphasized that business schools should have knowledge about their key stakeholders. The key needs should be clearly established and the key success factors should be identified for delivery, engagement and skill building. However, the resource allocation and branding are the major implications for the business schools as well as Universities. Prof Ralf discussed the issues related to commodity trap and concluded that in order to avoid the commodity traps, business schools should address the fundamental linkages through in operation investments and policies. They should drive the market instead of being market driven. The global

parameter to gauge the performance of Business Schools is students' placement. Therefore, Business schools should stay away from commoditization and create commodity trust for others by sticking to what should be done.

The second keynote speech was given by Dr. Ishrat Husain. He discussed his experience relating to strategy building of IBA Karachi and the steps taken to execute it. The activity started with the SWOT analysis. It was a collective exercise driven by a group well informed with the present and past of the institution. Few questions were formulated as a result of SWOT analysis. In the next step, stakeholders were identified followed by the focused group discussions. The main stakeholders identified were the alumni, employer, faculty, students and community leaders; the people outside the business but interested in high quality education specifically higher education. Structured questions were taken into account along with open ended discussions as a feedback mechanism. This stakeholder concentration in the focused groups produced the first draft of the strategy paper. The draft was floated to the active stakeholders to comment on the strategy. However, it required a lot of follow up to collect the feedback. Dr. Ishrat suggested that Business School should seek the active stakeholders to expedite the feedback mechanism. In Pakistan, mostly plans were formulated but they failed due to lack of monitoring and systematic evaluation. Monitoring is the critical success factor while implementing the strategic plan. At IBA, first they define five pillars, then the goals following the sub goals under each pillar. The plan also includes milestones, timelines and assigned responsibilities. It is believed that collective responsibility is nobody's responsibility therefore, clarifying the responsibility should be analytically addressed. KPIs should be measurable, quantifiable and verifiable. Third party evaluation plays significant role to gauge the progress in right direction. Accountability should be built in while preparing the strategic plan. Monitoring and evaluation is done at management level and accountability is done by a third party i.e. through BoGs and different committees. During implementation of strategic plan at IBA, six annual implementation plans and twelve half yearly implementation plans were placed before the BoG. This process gives the pointer to set the pace for next six months. He further suggested to the

Deans and Directors to spend lot of time in consultation with active stakeholders and be very honest in identifying your own (institution) weaknesses. Monitor strategy and subject yourself to accountable before BoG. He said that lot of work has not yet been done. One strategic plan is not enough therefore, vision and mission should be revisited continuously after every five-six years and then strategy should be followed with the new mission and vision. Employer prefers the competent person with right attitude and with highest ethical values. If we want to like to inculcate such ethical values in our students then we must practice them.

Academia, in particular, should adopt the mission to prepare students for civil society.

Dr. Zaher Zain asserted that Business schools should be relevant for the society; other organizations shall come to them for solution of their problems. For example, Universiti Kebangsaan (Malaysia) has connections with various NGOs and its students work in their projects. Additionally, research programs of the same institute are co-aligned with the priorities of the country. The underlying message is that students should be involved in real-time projects and productive for the society at large. To complement the aforementioned mission, strategic planning should be about filling the gap between 'what they want to do' (society) and 'what we want to do' (Academia).

Dr. Christophe added that although time, money and resources are important for sustainability but more important is the clear vision and strategy of the Business School. Business Schools should project themselves what would they like to achieve? While responding to the audience questions regarding sustainability of Business Schools, Dr. Zaher Zain replied that public sector institutes should not rely only on the Govt. funding. The sustainability model should include Endowments and Business School should work with other organizations to get funding. Dr. Ishrat added that depending on their physical infrastructure, they have offered multiple programs at IBA. As a result student's enrollment got doubled leading to 70% revenue generation internally. They got 15% endowments thus Govt. dependency declined drastically from 40% to 15% only.

## Session 2: Roles and Responsibilities of Business School's Teachers; Student's Perspective

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Abdus Sattar Abbasi	Head, Dept. of Management Sciences, COMSATS Institute of IT, Lahore
Dr. Ijaz Qureshi	Dean, Lahore Business School (LBS), University of Lahore
Dr. Ali Sajid	Professor, University of Lahore
Dr. Irfan Hyder	Dean CBM, Institute of Business Management, Karachi
Mr. Najaf Yawar Khan	Director, Management Sciences Dept., Government College University, Lahore

- A dire need to align student skills with market/industry demands. There is a kind of disconnect between classroom teaching and market requirements by employers.
- Importance of managing and meeting the expectations of the students; sharing industrial insights with the students is recommended. Faculty at a business school with industrial experience can play important role in bridging prevalent disconnect.
- Importance of making curriculum of Business Schools relevant to the Industrial demands
- To conduct analysis of perceived quality of education services

Discussion in this session centered on the perspective of students about the credibility of business education in general and their expectations from the faculty in particular. Dr. Abdus Sattar Abbasi moderated the session. Dr. Ijaz Qureshi deliberated upon the findings of a survey titled "Major Issues and Problems of University Students in Pakistan". The findings illustrated that 80% students are satisfied with the teaching methodology, teaching environment, evaluation process, counselling & support services, IT and Library resources and improvement in interpersonal skills. However, students seem discouraged due to insufficient financial grants and scholarship schemes. Similarly, students find it difficult to hunt a job on the basis of skills acquired during their degree program due to disconnect between skills provided by Business School and the skills required by the market. The panel suggested to conduct a need based analysis in order to analyze the demands of market to make the curriculum of business programs. All speakers acknowledged the need to align student skills with the demands of the corporate sector by making the curriculum of business education more relevant. Courses should also reflect upon prevalent corporate practices. Certain measures can be taken such as hiring individuals with Industrial experience as teachers (Lecturers and higher positions) and

seeking a formal input of corporate professionals i.e. in Board of Studies or Board of Faculty etc. Dr. Abbasi raised the issue of the inability of business education to inculcate capacity among students to cope with fast and ever-changing technology. Dr. Najaf Yawar Khan, asserted that students should not be perceived as customers but products, therefore, focus should be upon what students think rather than what works for them. He identified the four roles that Business Schools' faculty should play to meet the students' expectations. Being a Teacher, the faculty member can set professional standards and be able to transfer the absorbed knowledge. Being a Mentor, he/she could be an empathetic problem solver and a counselor individual student. The role of a Learner compels him to keep himself updated and shared the research and relevant opportunities with the students. To establish national and international industrial linkages for students' placements, the faculty should play the most important role of Go-Getter. Dr. Ali Sajid shared the findings of his survey on "Students Satisfaction & Quality of Administrative Service of Business Schools: Challenges & Opportunities". He concluded that there is a gap between student's perceptions and student's expectations and among factors and dimensions of the SERVQUAL Model, reliability, tangibility, responsiveness, assurance and empathy are

important for students. Dr. Irfan Hyders' talk was based on his experience of managing the expectations of students over the last 20 years as a teacher and predominantly as an academic administrator. Based on students' perspective, he explained the four roles of the teacher (i) Mentor, (ii) Practitioner, (iii) Judge and (iv) Instructor. Students always yearn to know the relevance of the subject to their future. How it would help them as a person, as a professional, and as a member of community. They want to know how any course or lecture will be of relevance to their professional careers and to their personal interactions and their future life. They want to know how the subject impacts the society and country. A teacher who enables this knowing is a mentor and a counselor. Being a practitioner, students expect that the teacher would make the content come alive in front of the class. Students expect that teacher would be able to give real life examples of what is being taught, make the context clear through personal examples or through convincing first hand stories embodying the subject lessons. Being a judge, teacher is supposed to be fair and should be impartial. Students expect that the sessional marks of quizzes, midterm's hourlies and class participation should be aligned with final exam marks. Any drastic mismatch between the two is problematic especially if the mismatch is towards the worse from a student's point of view. Justice should

not only be done, but should be seen to be done. While being the instructor, following is found to be most problematic from the perspective of students:

- i. Overuse of multimedia
- ii. Teacher's use of "grading" as a tool for forcing the students to study
- iii. Too much bookish teaching is also a cause of problem
- iv. A teacher who does too much flip-flop on the contents actually tells the students that he has not planned out the course well.
- v. Not understanding the pressures on students and making unreasonable demands without communicating and motivational techniques also creates many of the issues.

At the end he shared that motivation of student comes when they see the teacher assuming a higher moral ground on account of his character and his expertise. The teacher's role is to be the architect of the future of the lives of the students, future of the community and future of the country and future of this planet. A teacher who defines his role too narrowly loses out on bringing out the best from the students. In the nutshell, Business Schools should take the expectations of students seriously and adopt a curriculum that bridges the gap with the expectations in the markets.

## Session 3: Hiring and Motivating Qualified Faculty

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Ali Ahsan	Chairman, Centre of Advanced Studies in Management, Islamabad
Dr. Kamal Munir	Dean, Humanities and Social Sciences, LUMS & Professor, Cambridge Judge Business School
Dr. Sarwar Azhar	Vice Chancellor, Imperial College of Business Studies, Lahore
Dr. Konstantin Krotov	Managing Director, Graduate School of Management, St. Petersburg University, Russia
Dr. Sohail Zafar	Dean, Lahore School of Economics (LSE)
Dr. Abdul Raziq	Associate Professor, Balochistan University of IT, Engineering, and Management (BUIEMS), Quetta

- Qualified faculty is vital for achieving excellence in Academia
- Quality assurance bodies such as NBEAC should put pressure on the Business Schools to strive for excellence by improving their research output and hiring qualified faculty
- Saint Petersburg's University (Russia) and Lahore School of Economics (Pakistan) are striving for excellence in the domain of Business Education and can be perceived as role-models for others to follow
- Faculty have its share of expectations; it is important for the management to understand such expectations in order to retain them
- There is a need to revisit the hiring process of (Public Sector) Business Schools in Pakistan

In this session, the speakers stressed upon the importance of hiring qualified faculty members in the Business Schools and measures to retain them on long-term basis. Qualified faculty means faculty being capable of instilling the desired knowledge. Faculty should be able to inculcate knowledge in students that is relevant to the future and enables them for critical thinking.

Quality assurance bodies such as NBEAC should put pressure on the Business Schools to increase their research output and improve their faculty through the ranking process. Higher ranked Business Schools are likely to attract more attention from the Corporate Sector than lower ranked ones and bolster their image in the market. Saint Petersburg University (Russia) and Lahore School of Economics (Pakistan) are setting an example for others in this regard. Dr. Konstantin Krotov and Dr. Sohail Zafar highlighted some milestones of these institutes respectively. However, NBEAC encourages all Business Schools to strive for excellence and become relevant.

Hiring qualified faculty is an important objective; retaining them shall be another. Management of the Business Schools should keep in mind that faculty has its share of expectations from them. Competent faculty members are likely to expect good pay packages, seek funding for their research effort on need basis and expect recognition of their painstaking accomplishments. Management should attempt to fulfill these legitimate demands; by fulfilling such expectations, the Management can retain quality faculty for long-term basis.

Business Schools also have the option to hire (interested) graduates to work with senior faculty members to prepare them for teaching-related challenges and become competent teachers.

Dr. Abdul Raziq, in particular, pointed out the need to revisit faculty hiring procedures of Public Sector Business Schools. According to him, hiring procedures should be flexible for talent-hunting purpose and search committees should be trained to identify individuals who are genuinely competent for faculty positions among the candidates.



Dr. Ali Ahsan, moderator of the session started the session by sharing that faculty members should be encouraged to get involved in consultancy, business and research work. Faculty members should also carry out research projects rather than teaching only. Hiring the faculty is easier than motivating and retaining.

Dr. Kamal Muneer added that hiring faculty at business schools is not easy. How many PhDs and practitioners should you have in a business school appears to be a difficult questions. Practitioners are not researchers. Business schools are under pressure in terms of producing research work as business schools were not used to of this trend in past. Previously business schools were limited to publish their research in managerial journals but now a lot of economist, sociologists, and political scientists are part of business schools research work so the spectrum of research has grown wider. Moreover writing cases was quite common at business schools but the case writers were expected to write these cases in spare time and were also told not to expect any credits. It means that now a days business schools are under a lot of pressure to get more PhDs as part of faculty. But the question is how to make it happen? The biggest conference in terms of business management is the Academy of Management which holds conferences in different cities of America every year but there are hardly any business schools from Pakistan that are represented there. Whereas there were a lot of Middle Eastern schools in the said conference. Moreover Middle Eastern schools hire faculty from the west for yielding better results. These schools reward a lot of credit for research work as well. Financial Times ranking is the biggest ranking in the world in terms of business schools and it influence the number of people applying for the business school. So Pakistani business schools should look for international reputes so as to attract the faculty from around the world. Hiring is an art and it should be taken very seriously. Hiring should follow a proper procedure as well. Spend money, resources and time to attract and hire good faculty. Before hiring the faculty invite them to your school, socialize with them let them interact with the students and existing faculty so as to make feel comfortable. The management of Business schools should be very much particular about the fact if the faculty person they are looking for is willing to contribute their institution. Some faculty people are good on paper but practically they lack the will to contribute. We should go for hiring those people who are not

egocentric or self-centered. We need contributors. Getting rid of a difficult student is easier than getting rid of difficult colleagues. Think twice to interview a candidate who is a difficult person. Young faculty members need a proper counseling and mentoring. Mostly young faculty members don't exactly know what is expected of them and if they do they are not provided with proper resources to deliver. Moreover young faculty must be encouraged to go for publications. Give them courses off and let them interact with co-writers for publications. Make them realize the fact that institution is serious about them. Publications record and active participation make a faculty member stand out. Whenever there is crisis at business schools such faculty members are the first to quit. Dr. Kamal Muneer ended his discussion by saying that the focus should be on retaining the best resources.

Dr. Sarwar Azhar said that hiring and motivating the faculty is basically an HR concern. First we need to know what a qualified faculty is? The real issue is that we have the faculty which is teaching a curriculum which is based on older knowledge and trying to produce the graduates that will enter the particle life in a different time frame. This gap needs to be bridged. A good faculty member should be capable of motivating the student to become lifelong learners. A good faculty should try to produce students who are highly communicative, innovative, good team workers and critical thinkers. A good faculty should be able to produce students who are able to face the challenges of future.

Prof. Konstatntin Krotov shared the experience St. Petersburg while having 66 full time faculty members. 95 %of them are PhDs and out them 6 are full time international professors. We also have 20-25 visiting professors each year. Several lecturers are from the industry as well. Moreover, 30% of their university funds come for their corporate partners and less than 20 percent comes from government. They have accreditations and have a lot of international students. They also have a network of international partners and hire international professors. St. Petersburg focused on doing research and try providing good environment for research. They send their professors to research conferences. Their assessment is based on the research articles published per year.

Dr. Sohail Zafar shared his view to motivate the teachers to participate in administrative matters as well. We should encourage them to write articles and send them to take part in international conferences. They should be helped by senior faculty members in

terms of teaching. We mostly have full time faculty but do also have people from the industry as part time faculty. In terms of retaining the salary packages and incentives rewarded to faculty members should be revised.

Dr. Abdul Raziq had somewhat different opinion being in the public sector university. According to him private sector universities do have flexibility in hiring faculties. Public sector universities need a change in procedure regarding hiring faculties. For hiring chancellors of public sector universities government forms a committee. He suggested to use the same process for hiring faculty members.

However, providing training to these committees is very important. Good faculty members can be motivated for a particular aim. Good faculty attracts brilliant students as well. With good faculty institution can bring funding for itself.

During question answer session, few point of views came from audience as well like public universities have to follow rigid formula for hiring faculties. For motivating the faculty there should be monetary benefits. There should be more flexibility in the hiring process/ monetary benefits rewarded by public sector universities.

**Q-1. If faculty does not write the cases which it has to teach at universities; how can it affect the quality of case writing? What does panelist think about tenure system in terms of retaining the faculty?**

Dr. Kamal Munir responded that there are handful of schools (Harvard business school and case study Europe etc.) writing cases. At HBS they have huge faculty and its every member writes 8-10 cases. But here we write cases but we don't get acknowledged.

Prof. Konstantin Krotov shared that professor writes the cases and St. Petersburg registers the cases as well. Cases are mostly about 300 Russian companies. We stay in touch with the companies and sometimes they themselves ask us to write cases based on their material. It means industry and school work together for cases. We don't have tenure system. With tenure system we can't really retain our faculty.

Dr. Sarwar Azhar responded that it's the universities which decide whether a case writing is important or not because case writing is connected with the objectives of universities. I myself wrote cases and benefited from them as well. We don't have tenure track in the private sector but we have contract faculty, adjunct faculty, permanent faculty and visiting faculty. Adjunct faculty is like visiting faculty with a kind of permanent position. It gives us flexibility to ensure that a particular type of faculty is available at particular time. Adjunct faculty is alternative to tenure track system however Permanent faculty is best. Adjunct is feasible for evening and weekend programs. In terms of motivating the faculty to write cases the teaching schedule should be made in such a way that it becomes easier for the faculty to write cases.

**Q-2: What do the panelist say about performance and HR appraisal system?**

Dr. Sarwar Azhar responded that in some schools teaching is given more importance then research. But I think research does help teaching. Appraisal requires the contribution of the faculty. But often we ignore the support system required by the faculty to perform in terms of teaching, research and case study writing. Appraisal loses its efficacy if support system is not in place.

## Session 4: Visioning the Future of Business Education: Global Perspectives

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
Prof. Kerry L. Laufer	Director OnSite Global Consulting, TuckGO, Tuck School of Business, Dartmouth, USA
Prof. F. Robert Wheeler III	Founding Dean, Karachi School of Business & Leadership (KSBL)
Dr. Christophe Terrasse	Director Projects, European Foundation for Management Development (EFMD), Belgium
Dr. Ishrat Husain	Director, Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi

- The need for change in traditional organizational practices and priorities for fulfillment of co-aligned interests and objectives
- Importance of practical education; experiential learning and entrepreneurship
- Less theory, more practice-oriented research and teaching
- Tradition versus Innovation: striving for balance
- Leveraging technology to enhance teaching and learning
- Importance of global engagement
- Efforts shall be consistent for internationalization across the world
- Bringing change in the Academia is a challenging task but attainable; importance of revisiting vision and mission statement after some span of years

The session was moderated by Prof. Kerry L. Laufer. The speakers asserted to change the traditional practices at Business Schools by taking certain measures such as experiential learning, innovation and leveraging technology to enhance teaching and learning initiatives. In the context of experiential learning, it is important to send students to corporate sector to apply their theoretical knowledge in real-time problem situations in order to address them. Students with practical experience will influence learning environment and encourage practice-oriented research and teaching in the Business Schools. Prof. Kerry believes in learning by doing. During teaching she identified linkages with corporations having interesting business challenges and send her students team to help corporation out solve that problem. The challenges faced by business schools in the US are different from Pakistan. But striking balance between tradition and innovation is a common challenge. In previous days the US people faced a lot of talk about "dark days ahead" in terms of MBA program. Commentators identified alarming signs and warned us to take necessary steps. But it proved positive as it pushed US to think a lot above solutions. Before asking panelists to get involved in discussion she put some

prediction on the screen. These are based on what is happening in our schools in the US. These include;

- i. Less theory, more practice oriented research and teaching
- ii. More leveraging technology to enhance teaching and learning
- iii. More opportunities and demand for global engagement
- iv. More focus on responsible management
- v. More interest in entrepreneurship careers

Prof. Kerry asked few questions to the panel members.

**Q-1: What does a young Dean needs to do for betterment of the business schools?(For Dr. Ishrat)**

Dr. Ishrat replied to the question saying that we all have very strong attachment to the legacy and we often want to continue it. Bringing a change in school is very difficult because faculty is strong stakeholder in this regard so it must be taken on board while doing so. Keeping in view this we formed several committees of the faculty members and also asked them to handle academic management which was previously a responsibility of administration. All program directors

were selected from the faculty. During last eight years at IBA Karachi, they recruited 60 PhDs as faculty members. These newcomers had not relation with the legacy so they came up with new ideas. They also had international advisory committee and local focused groups. They revamped our MBA program by introducing 2 years working experience of management but this initiative result in drop in the number of students to 25 from 250. But IBA, Karachi persisted to it and today everybody recognizes our decision as right one. The number eventually started rising again. Secondly, the question was how 300 BBA graduates each semester will get jobs in the job market. But it was found that 90 percent of the graduates were getting job within six months of their graduation.

**Q-2: Can you tell us what will you do if you have to set up a new business school keeping in view your vast experience? (For Prof. Wheeler)**

Prof. Wheeler shared that he worked in many business schools around the world but found Pakistan the best; its people are very open and warm. He worked on founding the Karachi School for Business & Leadership (KSBL). He was also working for the Agha Khan. The first we should keep in mind is what kind of business school we need. If we are not clear about what we are going to do, things become very difficult. He reinforced Dr. Ishrats' idea of two years working experience after BBA and he supported the same at KSBL because having students with working experience in a class room changes their approach. Secondly he believes in strong ethical foundation for not students but for the faculty as well. Besides, teaching style is very important. Some schools are entirely case studies focused that good but experiential learning is more important. In US the lectures are supported by videos. Student watch the video before coming to class and this helps them develop questions. Video conference can also be used to take on board the international industry leaders and academics closer to schools in Pakistan. Besides entrepreneurship must be part of curricula.

Dr. Christophe said that there are around 15,000 business schools in the world of which only 1000 are accredited. Many schools don't know how to overcome their problems. The question that what big business schools are doing to help these small schools get better. Big school should get in contact with smaller ones and help them introduce themselves to the international community. In addition to the importance of collaboration between the Corporate Sector and Academia aside, it is also important to focus on the prospects of global engagement.

**Q-3: How to create space for research while keep the cost low? (For Dr. Ishrat)**

Dr. Ishrat presented the current faculty workload situation at IBA Karachi. He shared that there are units from each faculty. 04 course teaching is equal to 12 units. These units are divided into teaching, research and service. The faculty can trade off their teaching load with research provided they are able to produce research papers in the next year or semester. They can get credit for their teaching loads. Normally research faculty assign only two courses per semester and they are giving waivers for two courses they don't have to teach and they do research. Besides, there are research grants for them which they can compete for within the institution and they can spend their summer doing the research. Incentive structure, the course loan and personal preferences of the teachers should be aligned in order to produce results.

**Q-4 : What are the good ways of building experiential learning in BBA and MBA program?**

Prof Kerry herself responded to the question that there are many ways of going about it. Placing students on board of local nonprofit companies can help in this regard wherein students apply their skills practically. Moreover the students can be handed over the responsibility of managing their institutions funds. Incorporating models into existing course can also benefit.

**Q-5: How to manage ethics at business schools? (For Dr. Wheeler)**

Dr Wheeler responded that it's important to be culturally sensitive especially in Pakistan. Getting connected to global business schools network can help business schools diversify themselves.

Someone from audience commented that while teaching if you go beyond the traditional approach of text book study we can sometimes with any text have discussion on different related topics in the backdrop of local industry situation. The moderator shared that new experiments should be encouraged.

Speakers noted that Internationalization efforts can be homogenized by virtue of standardization of curriculum of Business Schools across the world. But consensus was that there could not be a one-size fit to all internationalization strategies however, efforts shall be consistent across the world in this regard. Advantage of this strategy would be that Business Schools would be able to prepare students for global industrial challenges and not just domestic industrial challenges.

## Session 5: Industry Expectations from the Business Graduates

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Imran Ali	Dean, Karachi School of Business & Leadership (KSBL)
Mr. Adeel Anwar	Director Organizational Development and Learning, Warid Telecom, Lahore
Mr. Ali Khurram Pasha	Head of Strategy and Leadership Development, Human Resources and Learning Group, Bank Alfalah, Karachi
Mr. Javed Hamid	Senior Adviser, International Executive Service Corps. (IESC), Washington DC, USA
Dr. Faheem-ul-Islam	Member, Ministry of Planning, Development and Reforms, Islamabad
Mr. Mohammad Ali Khan	Senior Education Specialist, International Finance Corporation (IFC), USA
Ms. Shahbano Hameed	Head of Corporate Solutions, Easypaisa, Telenor

- Business graduates tend to have shortcomings; lack in compliance with the 'code and conduct' of the Corporate Sector; lack in 'communication norms' followed in the Corporate Sector; lack in 'report writing skills' needed for the Corporate Sector; gap in the skills (acquired from the Academia) and skills (needed in the Corporate Sector); and sensitive to failures
- Academia and Corporate Sector share responsibility in addressing the aforementioned problems

This session featured speakers representing the Corporate Sector. Based on their observations, they highlighted some shortcomings of Business graduates such as lack in compliance with the 'code of conduct' of the Corporate Sector; lack in 'communication norms' followed in the Corporate Sector; lack in 'report writing skills' needed for the Corporate Sector; gap in the skills (acquired from the Academia) and skills (needed in the Corporate Sector); and sensitive to failures.

Mr. Adeel Anwar suggested the Business Schools to share their experiences with other Business Schools. Corporate ethics is not fully appreciated by the students when they join corporate sector. Corporate sector shows compliance to ethical values but the students need to have a deeper understanding of corporate ethics and code of conduct. Although students are taught about business ethics at school level but they appear not follow them. Students normally do not even follow the code of conduct while doing research and writing reports. They are seen not doing actual research rather they rely on internet sources. They are also not well aware of business language. Corporate sector spends millions of rupees on students when hired in order to improve their communication skills but even then they can't deliver properly. It means there are inherent faults in education system they have belonged to. Moreover

the students joining corporate also lack team work ability and when they become managers the said weakness causes damages to their performance. Although they are taught about team work mechanisms at school level but the related courses are too theoretical in nature. Students must be exposed to corporate environment properly at school level so as to overcome this problem. Corporate exposure at school level is limited to discussions only. Such discussions must be made interactive so that students get the actual insights of the problems.

The speakers acknowledged disconnect between the Academia and Corporate Sector and their responsibility in bridging it. They acknowledged some problems at their end such as Corporate Sector not expressing its needs properly and bias factor in hiring procedures (i.e. giving preference to graduates of some Business Schools over others). He responded to the question "How can academia partner with industry?" by sharing his teaching experience as a visiting faculty member. There are three types of faculty. First group comprises of those who are only dedicated to teaching. Second group is made up of those who have been in corporate but now they are part of academia and no continuous connection with industry. Third group has people like myself who do not have relevant educational background but have

comprehensive industry experience. What we need to do is to channelize all these groups. One such example is of "corporate to campus" activity in which industry people are brought closer to campus. Some corporate organizations are conducting very exciting programs and if universities happen to send their faculty to be part of these programs we can benefit from it.

Mr. Javed Hamid emphasized that proper exposure given to these graduates is very important. Experiential learn is of greater value in this regard. It's important to make sure that the graduates who join the industry have good accounting and finance skills. Secondly these graduates should be well versed with the use of soft wares related to marketing, finance, accounting and presentations etc. Thirdly the graduates should be good at oral and written communication skills. All the aforementioned things are taught at universities but there are few more things which are not easy in terms of teaching. First amongst them is the ability to work as a team. More time at schools should be allocated to team work learning. Secondly the student should have the ability to turn concepts into executions. Interactive approach for inculcating critical thinking amongst student is also very important. Moreover emotional intelligence should also be taught at schools which make students sensitive to work environment. This helps graduates understand the working environments. The ability to resolve conflicts is also an important component of learning. Trouble shooting must also be part of course at schools. Coming up with the genuine idea must be encouraged during teaching. Above all I would suggest students must be exposed to work environment during studies and can made possible by university and industry interaction.

Dr. Faheem ul Islam highlighted a few shortcomings of Academia; providing inadequate training to students for the projects in the corporate sector and not adopting state-of-the-art resources for management programs. The region is transforming; hence, Pakistan should also transform. Massive projects are going on in terms of infrastructure but we don't have enough trained human resources. The companies are hiring resources from Bangladesh and Srilanka. Our universities have not enough programs to train students for upcoming challenges in different fields. In the field of logistics, trucking, transportation, huge growth has been seen but again we don't have enough trained human resources. The system which we work in does not allow us to yield better results. The system comes up with its flaws at college level. Universities can play an important role

in this regard. When there is good intake then there would be good output. Universities and colleges must ensure that they admit good students. If we look at management programs there appears to be some perceptual problem. Management programs are like science and technology program wherein state of the art laboratories play pivotal role. In management programs there is no concept of state of the art laboratories. Weakness grows exponentially we go to high degree programs because we don't have much hi-tech labs at this level as well. So redefining the perception of our management programs is what we really need to do. 90% of the value addition and learning happens outside the class rooms, so our teaching must be practical orientated. The applied programs are not well connected with the industry. Industry needs graduates so they should be in touch with universities. Similarly the responsibility lies on universities shoulder as well. If there is a master level program at university and it does not have any strategic connection with the relevant industry, it is difficult to produce good graduates. Management has transformed over the period of years, so today we need to have management labs and university industry linkage to face the modern challenges. In the developed countries at senior level the students are encouraged to spend more time with industry rather than class rooms whereas in Pakistan students go for a short term internship and then look for job. This approach is not positive. We should adopt the best international practices to bring in betterment. Likewise microfinance sector has grown a lot but there is not enough human resource for it. Simply putting it, we have to reinvent our education system. The best comes with differentiation not similarity. Excellence comes from being different.

Mohammad Ali Khan started the discussion by sharing results of a survey. It was done by Mackenzie and is considered around 12 countries across the globe. The survey tried to measure the perceptions of three stakeholder's namely higher education providers, employers and students. According to this survey 70 percent higher education providers said that they are meeting the employers' requirement but only 30 percent of the employers agreed with their point of view and only one third of the students seemed to agree with higher education provider's claim. It means that there is huge gap between the points of views of all the said stake-holders. This situation expects an increased interaction between all these stakeholders. Keeping this in view, Canadian government has introduced the concept of employability skills and is taking this concept work at

industry level as well. For each key sector of economy Canadian government has introduced sector advisory councils comprising of major players of the sectors and the key education service providers. We should follow this example as it allows a great opportunity of academia and industry linkage. Employers must also be trained to be good employers. According to the said survey business schools are fulfilling the requirements of industry which has led to the emergence of a third market called “the last mile connectivity”. The time period between the graduating and getting a job is the focus of the last mile connectivity. This third market industry helps the graduates in grooming and looking for jobs and many of these companies are online. There is company of such nature in India named aspiring minds that helps tests graduates' attitude for a particular line of work. 270 million people are unemployed and an equal number of people are under employed. Such initiatives can be helpful in this regard. There is a huge gap between what industry needs and what graduates come up with so we need to address this issue on solid grounds.

Ms. Shahbano Hameed shared the hiring process at Telenor. The evaluation is performed beyond the degree of graduate. At times a graduate from well reputed university fails to get a job and one with a smaller university succeeds. What we look for in a potential candidate besides qualities like leadership, team work and innovation etc. is the “Grit Factor”. By grit we mean the ability to not give up in face of competition and it is based on hard work and persistence. I think the said factor is missing at university level. Besides, interpersonal skills are very important for being a good manager. Telenor have different programs for females as well i.e. “Naya Aghaz” etc. It caters female employees as well in this program. Telenor have also close linkages with universities and frequently shared our requirements. Telenor also offers annual and global internship programs that have helped graduates to become successful employee.

During question answer session, the participant asked question about mile connectivity which Mr. Adeel Anwar responded by saying that “the mile connectivity” can be termed as “corporate finishing”. He requested all the employers to upgrade their job placement centers. Please reward and encourage the placement executives. He said that the candidates for jobs are very reward oriented and growth conscious. These expectations can be met easily. A good placement department can address the reward expectations by giving the candidates

the right insight about industry and its reward distinctions. If our placement executives do not have good insight about industry and its profitability, they will undersell the graduates. When it comes to graduates' expectations about growth they should be given mentors from the industry so they have true insight in this regard. The best mentors in this particular perspective can be Alumni members.

**Q-1: According to latest surveys 43 % of the employers fail to recruit good graduates. Please identify the a few deficiencies in graduates.**

Mr. Adeel Anwar suggested a dialogue between Universities and Industry to increase employability skills of graduates. What is required by employer and what is taught to a graduate has got discrepancies; it should be addressed.

**Q-2: Is there a shift from global managers to global leaders?**

Mr. Ali Khurram Pasha said to first talk about global values at school level. We should train our students to be able to operate in globalized environment.

**Q-3: What is the opinion of the panel about “Experiential Learning”?**

Mr. Muhammad Ali responded by sharing example of corporate program at University of Waterloo, Canada considered as world leaders in designing the programs of corporative education. The duration of normal MBA degree is five years in the University. However, three semesters involved paid working thus creating the experience profile of 10-15 months at the time of graduation. This example has now been emulated in other parts of world. It's a great idea to provide opportunity to the young student in terms of learning, formal skillset but also culture. They got embedded with the work ethics. They learn to come on time, dress appropriately, interact courteously, empathetic, to work with disagreements, to deal with conflicts. If the students learn these skills in younger stage of their career, it helps them in their career building.

**Q-4: Could Business Schools teach the graduates the ability to go with “Change”? And how to manage it?**

Dr. Faheem ul Islam responded that “Change” is in-built in good strategy making, planning and implementation. Teaching change without strategy is a disaster both at teaching level and in practice side. We should understand what type of transformation “the Change” is going to bring? It's a risky thing in fact.

Dr. Javed Hamid added that it's difficult to teach but exposure could be provided to student about bringing

change and their consequences though discussing case studies. They will learn the consequence and how to manage the Changes.

**Q-5: What is more important for the employers while hiring graduates: From which University they are coming from? Or what do they offer to the organization?**

Is there a hiring bias?

Dr. Faheem ul Islam said that there are biases due to memory recall through which perceptions are built. It is very important for University to create their brand image. Brand images cannot be fictitious. Graduates must possess skillsets to prove themselves. Simple placements and cover ups do not help too much. When direct experience starts, the media communication and all other material goes in to backgrounds. The evaluators use direct experience to develop their perceptions. So let the direct experience be according to the expectations of

employers. University should honestly create good skills, capable graduates, present them nicely. In simplest terms, that's the way forward. But yes there is a role for memory recall and our prior perception from where we hire good graduates. That is also termed as sourcing efficiency.

The session ended with a small suggestion from the moderator, Dr. Imran Ali that we should look at ourselves; how do we transform to tune in ourselves with our own Business Environment. The Business Schools should be aware of the nature of their faculty as if they are going to be able to deliver what is required from transforming business industry rather than extracting texts from the foreign text books. Being faculty of Business Schools, we should be half teachers and half corporate representatives. We should spend time in factories and bring the insights back in classrooms. Thus we should think about ourselves how we begin to transforming to much more relevant body of academia.



## Session 6: Making Business Schools more relevant for the Industry - Challenges and Opportunities for Forging Linkages and Partnerships

Speakers	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Ehsan ul Haq	Professor, LUMS
Mr. Sajjad Kirmani	CEO, Infogistics, Lahore
Mr. Arif Ijaz	Adviser to CEO, Maple Leaf Cement Group, Lahore
Mr. Osman Khalid Waheed	President, Ferozsons Laboratories Ltd., Lahore
Mr. Omar Saeed	CEO, Service Industries Ltd., Lahore
Dr. Dharmasiri Ajantha Sujewa	Director, Postgraduate Institute of Management, University of Sri Jayewardenepura, Sri Lanka

- Elaboration of level of disconnect between the Business Schools and the Corporate Sector
- The importance of making Academia compliant with corporate requirements
- Emphasis upon skills (soft; entrepreneurial; communication; technical; integrative; and others)

Dr. Ehsan ul Haq, Professor, LUMS stated that this session was a follow-up of earlier session "University-Industry linkage" He appreciated that the panel comprised of three to four leading practitioners and all of them have direct or indirect linkage with the university which means they are not only successful businessmen but they also have close links with the university so it would be worthwhile to hear them. There was not any presentation in the panel discussion rather it was sharing of panelists' thought only.

Mr. Usman Khalid Waheed: Mr. Usman Khalid shared his thoughts that the traditional paradigm of the industry in the 20th century was to look for technical specialists. But in 21st century, a different approach is needed. Employers need to realize that skill sector requirements are changing. Even established corporations need to have an entrepreneurial mindset as the environment is rapidly changing. At the undergraduate level, a multidisciplinary approach is needed to combine with broad based curriculum so that the students become better informed citizens with a broader outlook to life. Seeing things from multiple perspectives is needed with the technical competence and that can happen only when the said approach is present at university and college level.

Dr. Ehsan ul Haq to Mr. Usman Khalid Waheed: Although your response focused on students but we

should also talk about faculty members as well. Faculty contributes to the industry a lot. So, how to engage faculty members with the industry?

Mr. Usman Khalid Waheed: (responding to Ehsan) At the larger level, the approach will be very similar. The greatest innovations take place on the boundaries between disciplines. While engaged with a particular university, employers should try to build a relationship that spurs innovation. LUMS has strength today that it did not have 30 years ago owing to the fact that it's purely a business school. Now it has various disciplines under one campus including school of science and engineering, humanities and social sciences and a law school. In terms of industry and academia relationship such an approach is very supportive. Such a multidisciplinary approach applies both to students and faculty.

Dr. Ehsan ul Haq requested Mr. Arif Ijaz and Mr. Umar Saeed to share their thoughts.

Mr. Arif Ijaz has been actively involved with the academia for the last 15 years. He has been teaching at business schools as well besides being engaged in the corporate sector for 30 years. He shared that there are three barriers between the business schools and practitioners. First is what Usman has already talked about and that's very true; the difference between what the business schools are

teaching and what the corporate sector requires? There will always be a grey area because of the very nature of education as you cannot have tailor-made a business practitioner at a business school. He shared that he looked upon three things while hiring a resource: (a) leadership skills, (b) integrated skills and (c) professional skills like marketing, finance and HR etc. Most business schools do not look at it this way. It's a classical issue not even Harvard looks at it this way. What practitioners should try to understand is that "a school or a university is inherently different from the real life in terms of mindset". A professor or a student is basically intellect driven whereas in real life innovation is the key to success. So an entrepreneur should try to combine a student's intellect with innovation. Unfortunately employers of Pakistan are unaware of this fact. A few companies apart from multinationals have a dedicated training program to turn the intellect driven student into innovation driven professional. Besides, this is the problem of superiority complex; a professor with a PhD degree feels superior to a managing director or CEO of the company and vice versa. This problem needs a solution. Maybe we need to introduce soft skills at school level. This is a core problem which creates a gap between academia and practitioners.

Mr. Umar Saeed: He shared his understanding of business schools and their integration with industry in Pakistan. He has been teaching at different institutions besides hiring resources from these institutions while being part of industry. He said that the first thing is that there is not enough faculty members with real life business experience. He said that students are much more receptive to faculty member with industry experience. The second thing which is also very important is that faculty should break into the industry. The more the academic institutions link with the industry the more chances we have to bridge the gap between academia and industry. This will also allow faculty and industry people to learn from each other. Adding to what Mr. Arif said earlier about the structured training programs at industry, Servis industries created a position called Assistant to CEO. The idea was to hire a multidisciplinary school resource and allow him to perform multitasks. This idea worked a lot. He recommended that academic institutions should work with industry on such models. Business has evolved a lot. It is innovation that moves the business these days so academia should also focus on it. Some academic institutions have tried to create centers of entrepreneurship as that's really commendable. He requested Deans and Directors to focus on the

innovation aspect of teaching in order provide good resource to the industry.

Dr. Ajantha Dharmasiri emphasized to bridge the gap between academia and industry. Coming from the only largest management school in Srilanka, he shared the way they have tried to tackle the issue in Srilanka. The Faculty and Management of Business School always try to stay in touch with the industry. Participants of our programs are from the industry as there is not any program of full time MBAs in Srilanka (all are part time MBAs). The working managers are catered through this program. The study timings are between 5:30 to 8:30 in the evening. He shared a five "S" mode with the audience.

- (a) Sensing -means you should be able to sense the new opportunities coming up in the industry. As part of this "MBA in taxation" program is launched for the first time in Asia. MBA program is tailored for the department of revenue and by doing that it is tried to cater to the industry needs. Likewise, we are working on the program of MBA for lawyers helping lawyers to manage their businesses.
- (b) Sized the opportunity- After sensing, sized or quantified it as well
- (c) Seize it before your competitor gets it
- (d) Strategize the opportunity- . For that there are annual faculty retreat sessions. In these sessions the critical brainstorming takes place. The experts are invited and suggestions are taken from them on tailor-made MBA programs.
- (e) Sustaining- means "how can we sustain our endeavors". The overall idea of the program is to come up with the MBAs who are "thinking doers" as opposed to merely doers. According to Aldous Huxley "At the end of the day what matters is not how much you know but how much you have done". Knowing should lead to doing. Theories taught at academic intuitions should have practice perspective too.

Sajjad Kirmani shared that IT industry is growing 25-30 percent every year. There are a lot of success stories in the last 3-4 years where freelancers have been seen earning million to half a million dollar of revenue and we have also seen companies begging for 100 million dollar contracts. The industry lacks capacity to create new things and innovation. India's model is service oriented while ours is innovation driven. We are short of human resource as well. There is a gap between academia and industry. Industry

seems unaware of what's going on at universities. Therefore, whatever research is going on at academia should be properly projected so that it comes into the notice of industry. There must be a framework in this regard so that industry stays connected to the academia. LUMS came up with digital signaling lab idea and that was commercialized through the involvement of a company. So I re-emphasize that main stream academia should be in touch with industry.

Dr. Ehsan ul Haq responded that academia and industry collaboration is happening but it does not come into the lime light. Each school runs MBA projects and these projects invariably come from the industry and academic institutions are funded by industry in this regard. Companies paying 100 thousand to 150 thousand to students is worthwhile. But engagement level of faculty with the industry is not very impressive. He has taken the opinion of panelists as how many of them have contacted the faculty in this regard? One more thing is regarding case method of teaching and studies as it forces the faculty to go beyond the school premises and meet the practitioners. Besides, the board members' role is also important.

After this the question and answer session started. Somebody from the audience shared that we need to focus on the innovational side of this matter. Multidisciplinary approach is of real value. Arif Ijaz added that we should also start teaching humanities in business schools and companies should also start spending on the social work besides spending on business related skills.

Someone from the audience commented that there is a great dearth of PhDs in business schools and we are looking for faculty-industry linkage. Mr. Umar Saeed responded that industry practitioners should be hired as teachers at business schools. I have gone through this experience. I run a company and have been teaching at LUMS as well. This practice has really been rewarding. I also suggest my business fellows to follow the same.

**Q-1: What do you mean by strategic alliance between schools and companies, some examples please? (the question is addressed to the whole panel)**

Mr. Usman Khalid Waheed responded that by strategic alliances we mean something that can add value to an extended period of time. The obvious example is of developing human resource. There is a position called professor of practice in the leading schools around the world and that's the position we have been able to explore properly. Academia plays an important role in helping industry formulate its strategies.

Mr. Arif Ijaz commented that there is no such strategic alliance between industry and business schools today in Pakistan.

Dr. Ajantha Dharmasiri responded that he was working for two top notch multinational companies of Srilanka when he was asked to teach as well. Consequently his income reduced but the satisfaction level increased. He knows many industry people who are teaching in the institutions are better able to share their experience with the student. We need to train students to think out of the box. Imagination leads to innovation which in turn leads to implementation.

Dr. Ehsan ul Haq has summed up the discussion by saying that tactical alliances are the beginning of strategic alliances. Nestle came to LUMS for getting a program for Agricultural Managers who were good agronomists but lacked business skills. LUMS helped them out.

**Q-2: What is an innovation lab and how does it work? (a question to the whole panel)**

Sajjad Kirmani said that LUMS Centre for social entrepreneurship is an example of it. Students from outside also come there and share their ideas. Many such initiatives have been taken by Punjab IT Board. Innovation lab connects the early stage innovators with the mentors so that they can fine-tune their ideas and make them marketable.

# Roundtable Session 1: Unique Challenges of Rural/Remote Universities

## Moderator

Dr. Sadia Nadeem

## Institutes / Professions

Associate Professor, FAST School of Management, FAST nu, Islamabad

## Highlights:

- Focus on addressing internal and external challenges experienced by the Business Schools in rural/remote areas including availability of qualified staff, limited resources, mentoring and motivating students (from rural/remote areas) to become skilled workers and limited opportunities for establishing links with the Corporate Sector
- HEC needs to bring the Business Schools in rural/remote areas into the fold via special arrangements for funding, faculty resources, research, and additional support

## Summary:

The Delphi session technique was applied to moderate this session. The first iteration was held ten days before the session took place through email distribution of the survey questionnaire to all registered participants from rural/remote universities. The questionnaire also addressed the challenges related to the expectations from HEC and/or Universities in Larger Cities and/or any External Bodies. The 90 min Delphi session comprised of three iterations in which the top ten challenges were identified in the six categories addressed in the questionnaire.

### External Challenges:

- i. Disconnect between theory application in the society and industry
- ii. Poor road to the campus
- iii. Lack of sufficient academic environment outside the institute
- iv. Parents interaction with the university
- v. Potential terrorism
- vi. Availability of text books and reference books in the nearest markets
- vii. Regional/ ethnic issues (language and culture)
- viii. Female participation in educational activities
- ix. Power shut downs
- x. Poor Internet facilities

### Student Related Challenges

- i. Weak writing abilities of students
- ii. Low paying power of students (to pay the fee)
- iii. Lack of communication skills
- iv. Quality of college and school level education (Foundation)

- v. Urdu to English medium shift from school to university
- vi. Finding jobs after completing education
- vii. Lack of knowledge about career
- viii. Lack of exposure of students
- ix. Lack of priority to seek quality education
- x. Access to libraries, research journals and computer labs

### Faculty related Challenges

- i. Lack of contact among industry people and teachers
- ii. Retaining qualified faculty
- iii. Motivating faculty to create industry/external linkages
- iv. Education facilities for children of faculty and staff
- v. Finding qualified faculty
- vi. Extra workload/administrative work
- vii. Limited earning due to limited availability of opportunities for research and consultancies
- viii. Lack of availability of research material
- ix. Lack of teachers training
- x. Accommodation facilities for the faculty and staff

### Industry/External linkage Challenges

- i. Lack of educated industrialist in this city
- ii. No linkage between academic and industrial research
- iii. Lack of access to real issues of industry for research
- iv. Lack of industry, large employers, NGOs etc. near the university

- v. Gap between industry requirement and students' knowledge and understanding
- vi. No proper networking of university with industry
- vii. Reluctance of faculty to visit organizations
- viii. Limited funding for linkages
- ix. Personal interest of industry people regarding institute
- x. Reluctance of external organizations to visit universities in remote areas.

### Research related Challenges

- i. Lack of educated industrialist in this city
- ii. No linkage between academic and industrial research
- iii. Lack of access to real issues of industry for research
- iv. Lack of industry, large employers, NGOs etc. near the university
- v. Gap between industry requirement and students' knowledge and understanding
- vi. No proper networking of university with industry
- vii. Reluctance of faculty to visit organizations
- viii. Limited funding for linkages
- ix. Personal interest of industry people regarding institute
- x. Reluctance of external organizations to visit universities in remote areas.

### Following additional challenges are also identified by the participants:

- i. Allocation of funds for infrastructure development
- ii. Lack of availability of senior faculty and senior managers/administrators

- iii. Lack of proper utilization of line of authority
- iv. Biasness, Favoritism and Nepotism
- v. Space and building availability
- vi. Lack of visionary leader
- vii. Implementation of IT
- viii. HEC funding
- ix. Enforcement of HEC and relevant regulatory bodies to induct PhD Faculty, especially at administrative positions

The following solutions were proposed after healthy discussion between the participants:

- i. HEC should support collaboration with international universities
- ii. Faculty development program should be implemented
- iii. HEC should organize different programs for faculty and students to develop industry-academia liason
- vi. Seminars/ workshops and guest lectures by experts from national and international universities should be organized in weaker universities
- v. HEC should grant funds to remote universities
- vi. Similar to the IPFP (Interim Placement of Fresh PhDs) program, the HEC can consider supporting qualified faculty in smaller cities
- vii. Remote/rural universities should form networks to share faculty
- viii. HEC should provide more scholarships for students in remote areas
- ix. Accreditation Councils such as NBEAC should value the contribution of universities working in smaller cities. This should be reflected in the accreditation criteria metrics.

## Roundtable Session 2: How to Cultivate a Research Culture in Business Schools?

Moderator	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Shaukat Brah	Former Dean, Karachi School of Business and Leadership (KSBL)

### Highlights:

- The need for strong focus on the research output of the Business School.
- The rewards in terms of promotions and financial package should focus on quality rather than quantity especially for top tier business schools.
- Focus on realistic match between the Inputs and Outputs: putting the formula [Input → Good transform (good research culture) → meaningful output] in practice.
- Importance of motivating Faculty Members to produce meaningful results; this is possible through funding their efforts and rewarding them for their painstaking accomplishments.
- Adopting realistic approach towards research output; aiming for journals based upon the present faculty mix and raising the bar as the faculty mix improves.
- The importance of encouraging faculty members to participate in Workshops, Seminars and Conferences to enhance their skills

### Summary:

While starting the session Dr. Brah suggested the audience to think in terms of institution. The solution should be focused on institutions. Setting high targets is good but we should not look for impossible targets. He shared his experience while working in American Universities. There are four types of universities;

- (i) Research Intensive Universities like Stanford and Venton etc. wherein professors are PhDs have on their credit a lot of articles published in top magazines and they are seen as specialists of field globally
- (ii) Research Universities. We have in Pakistan a few universities that qualifies in this regard. In such universities, 70 percent of the faculty holds PhD degrees.
- (iii) Mixed Universities striking a balance between research and teaching. Pakistan's most universities fall in this categories.
- (iv) Teaching Universities where 70 percent is PhD faculty and 30 percent is non PhD. But in Pakistan 90 percent of the faculty is non PhD. Administration plays a crucial role in transforming the inputs into outputs. Better research culture also helps in this regard.

He shared the "4-R Model" of research in Business Schools.

- (a) Rigor based on the research.
- (b) Relevance which means what's happening around in the industry.
- (c) Resources means the qualified faculty. We should match our qualifications with our expectations to

yield better results. Qualified faculty, good libraries, good internet facilities, good competency skills, opportunities, supportive incentive systems are important for uplift of business schools.

- (d) Reward - The management should encourage multiple forms of scholarship. However, the reward should be commensurate with amount of efforts involved, and quality and impact of output. Perhaps, it will be prudent for the management to grant sufficient leverage to faculty members to start from somewhere and (slowly but surely) accomplish excellence in the field of research. This is important because the reputation and impact of the business school depends heavily on the scholarly output of its faculty members. Above all good evaluation mechanism is very important for fostering research culture.

Dr. Shaukat Brah stressed the need for demonstrating measurable scholarly output from all faculty members of the business schools.

He closed the session by saying that the major burden of creating a research culture rests with the Management of a Business School. The leadership should revisit the orientation and focus on attaining realistic match between the inputs and outputs. The management must recruit the right faculty in line with the vision and mission of the school and make all efforts to motivate faculty members to contribute to impactful research output. It is the primary responsibility of management to provide funding for research and reward measurable quality output. Also, the management should encourage faculty members to participate in workshops, seminars and conferences to enhance their skills.

## Roundtable Session 3: Unique Challenges for Public Sector Universities

**Moderator**

**Dr. Sayyid Salman Rizavi**

**Institutes / Professions**

Director General, University of Punjab, Gujranwala Campus

### Highlights:

- Public Sector Universities face a number of challenges including financial sustainability, retaining qualified staff, upholding change-oriented vision, improving research quality and addressing administrative shortcomings
- Importance of addressing the challenges

### Summary:

Dr. Sayyid Salam Rizavi initially elaborated a number of challenges that Public Sector Universities are experiencing in Pakistan such as financial sustainability (by virtue of reduction of funding from government), recruiting and retaining qualified staff on long-term basis (by virtue of less appealing salary structure and lack of incentives in comparison to options in the Private Sector), difficulty in developing a market-driven and entrepreneurial culture (lack of flexibility), improving research quality (due to lack of state-of-the-art facilities and equipment) and administrative shortcomings (laziness of workforce and political interferences).

The speaker stressed upon the importance of overcoming aforementioned challenges by achieving greater autonomy in operations and policy-making, revisiting the matters of salary structure and incentives, exercising flexibility in rules and making effort to lower the influence of bureaucratic norms, developing state-of-the-art facilities to support research program, making workforce more efficient and reducing political interferences. However, overcoming these challenges is a daunting task and necessitates governmental cooperation towards this end.

## Roundtable Session 4: Quality Assurance in Public Administration

Moderator	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Zafar Iqbal Jadoon	Dean University of Central Punjab (UCP), Lahore

### Highlights:

- Understanding the phenomenon of quality assurance and its complications
- Complications include disconnect between the public departments and public sector educational institutes, inefficiency in follow-ups and lack of accountability
- Importance of self-assessment
- Importance of developing relationship with different Stakeholders; building linkages between public administration departments and public organizations
- Importance of adopting Common Assessment Framework (CAF) for mutual cooperation among the stakeholders

### Summary:

Dr. Zafar Iqbal Jadoon explained the issues and challenges of adoption of TQM system in public organizations and public administration in Pakistan. He shared his experience of using Common Assessment Framework, a European TQM tool for self-assessment of quality, in public organizations in Pakistan under the auspices of UNICEF, Pakistan. He introduced CAF to the participants in detail which is a very comprehensive quality assessment tool. He explained to the group that biggest issue in public administration in Pakistan is the lack of well-defined processes and absence of clear sense of shared mission and strategy of the departments under study. As a result, there is a total absence of result measurement which is rooted in the culture of authority without accountability. There is too much emphasis on the rules but a complete omission of result-based accountability.

After a lively discussion among the participants, a consensus was developed for proactive role of department of public administration of various

Pakistani universities in their respective localities and provinces to introduce the idea of TQM and build coalition with local bureaucrats and politicians. CAF can be a good tool to start with. In this regard, faculty and students of BS/MPA should be trained to use the CAF. The departments should offer their services to their respective partners in public organizations for implementation of CAF. Internship program and research projects should be organized around CAF. Dr. Jadoon offered to the participants his guidance and advice on the understanding of CAF and its implementation in public organizations in Pakistan.

It was further resolved that public administrative department should network with each other to ultimately establish an independent professional body on the pattern of American Association of Public Administration which could provide a platform for public administration educationists and practitioners for advocacy of quality improvement in public administration in Pakistan.



## Roundtable Session 5: The Crises and Challenges of Commerce Education

**Moderator**

**Dr. Anwar Ali Shah**

**Institutes / Professions**

Pro-Vice Chancellor, University of Sindh, Jamshoro

### Highlights:

- Commerce is a poorly understood discipline
- Disconnect between Commerce Schools and Corporate Sector
- The importance of making curriculum of Commerce education relevant to Industrial demands
- The need for qualified faculty in Commerce Schools in remote regions

### Summary:

Dr. Anwar Ali Shah asserted that Commerce is a poorly understood discipline in professional circles. As a consequence, Commerce graduates are commonly perceived as accounting specialists in professional circles. However, the scope of Commerce education extends to marketing practices, supply chain management, financial matters and auditing practices. In stricter terms, Commerce represents a branch of Business that is concerned with exchange of goods and affiliated activities. The scope of Commerce education overlaps with that of Business education but the latter is a relatively broader discipline covering all aspects of Business practices.

Commerce schools also share disconnect with the Corporate Sector alongside Business Schools in Pakistan. The existing curriculum of Commerce education is not relevant to Industrial demands. In

addition, Commerce schools are not effectively marketing the ground realities of the discipline and areas of expertise of their graduates; this leads to misconception about the areas of expertise of Commerce graduates in the Corporate Sector. Moreover, Commerce Schools in remote areas are lacking in qualified faculty.

There is a need to bridge disconnect between Commerce Schools and Corporate Sector in order to facilitate growth of job opportunities for corporate graduates in the Corporate Sector at large; this can be made possible through involving Industrial experts in making the curriculum of Corporate Sector relevant to Industrial demands. Commerce Schools also need to revisit their marketing strategies and address misconceptions about the discipline in professional circles.

## Workshop I: Engaging your Faculty in Management Consulting; Benefits to the Business Schools and the Faculty

Moderator	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Zahoor Hasan Syed	Professor, LUMS

### Highlights:

- Understanding the importance and benefits of faculty consulting for outside organizations
- Consultations should be purposeful; competence-oriented; process-oriented; and training-oriented
- Importance of consultations in bridging disconnect between Academia and Corporate Sector

### Summary:

Dr. Zahoor elaborated the importance and benefits of consultations among professionals in this session. The importance of consultation is such that it should be perceived as an integral part of a faculty member's profession or career profile. Consultation by the faculty should be purposeful and could be classified as competence-oriented, process-oriented and training-oriented. Competence-oriented consultation is about developing greater understanding of areas of specialization. Process-oriented consultation is about enhancing (individual and/or group) effectiveness, shortening meeting times and conflict-resolution. Training-oriented consultation is intended for acquiring new skills through (formal and/or informal means of) training.

Management of a Business School should be encouraging consultations among the faculty members. Consultation enables faculty members to

address shortcomings in their work, skills and knowledge, and make them more productive for the institutions they serve. Consultation should not just be inter-organizational but also cross-organizational; consultation is vital for bridging disconnect between Academia and Corporate Sector. Cross-organizational consultations would enable faculty members become aware of Industrial problems and latest developments. Moreover, corporate professionals can be requested to visit Business Schools and share their experiences with students.

The speaker asserted that questioning, research work, observations, interactions and case-writings are useful approaches for consultation. Consultation is important for conducting case study research in particular.

## Workshop II: Developing Entrepreneurs; Refining the Curriculum and Guiding your Faculty

Moderator	Institutes / Professions
Dr. Nauman Farooqi	Professor, Mount Allison University, Canada
Dr. Shahid Qureshi	Director, Center for Entrepreneurship Development, Institute of Business Administration (IBA), Karachi

### Highlights:

- Understanding the importance of experiential learning; focus on linking theory with practice through learning by doing.
- Job market is small; entrepreneurship is the way forward
- The need to reexamine curriculum of Business education from the perspective of developing entrepreneurial skills of students
- The importance of developing expertise in entrepreneurial education
- The Importance of evaluating students through field-based projects

### Summary:

This session was about highlighting the importance of experiential learning through entrepreneurial ventures in Business education. The speakers asserted that Business Schools should revisit curriculum of business education from the perspective of developing entrepreneurial skills of students to prepare them for the challenges of business ventures and groom them for critical thinking; skills that are vital for growth in Corporate Sector based careers. Entrepreneurial skills would encourage business graduates to commence their own business ventures through collaboration, if they have the resources to make them happen. Job market is small in Pakistan and entrepreneurial skills are the way forward from this dilemma.

The speakers asserted that faculty members of a Business School should acquaint themselves with the discipline of entrepreneurial education; faculty

members have the option to participate in relevant workshops and consult relevant materials to develop a reasonable understanding of this discipline.

The faculty members should understand the importance of evaluating students through field-based projects if they intend to promote experiential learning in business education. They should facilitate students in the matters of establishing real-life ventures and allow them to learn by trial and error

The faculty members should focus on creating opportunities for students to link theory with practice through creating opportunities for them to learning by doing.

## Closing session



Speakers	Institutes / Professions
<b>Mr. Syed Babar Ali</b>	Pro Chancellor, LUMS
<b>Dr. Hasan Sohaib Murad</b>	Chairman, NBEAC

The conference concluded on a positive note. Syed Babar Ali addressed the participants and congratulated the National Business Education Accreditation Council for taking this initiative to bring business schools from different parts of the country together. He was glad of having 80 business schools in the country and most of them are participating in the conference. He welcomed all of them in Lahore and congratulated them for the initiative of establishing business schools. He recognized gladly that there are so many centers of business at business schools. He narrated the story of Genghis Khan demonstrating the incompetence issue as the cruel reality of Pakistani society. His worthy suggestions for leaders to exhibit integrity and provide opportunities to competent individuals will definitely help in thriving the Businesses and Economy of the country. He shared that 25 years ago the Harvard business school took the initiative to set up center for social enterprise. He have been the part of this center's advisory board. Initially the social enterprise was introduced as an optional subject but latter it turned into a core subject. Every business school in America has social enterprise as core subject today. Consequently ten percent of the students of American business school eventually

dedicate their lives to social work. He suggested social enterprise to made part of our curriculum in Pakistan. We need people to work in the social area because that will help fill the gap between rich and the poor. We at LUMS keep our doors open. We run programs and invite other academic institution to come and share their experiences. We need inculcate the importance of esthetics and integrity. Youth with integrity is invaluable. Quran also stresses upon honesty. Be fair not only in buying and selling but in judgment as well. Teachers must not follow favoritism and students when turned businessmen must appoint resources on merit. He ended with the note that it's pleasant to see all Business Schools here. It's like a dream coming true.

The closing speech gave an immense motivation when he amalgamated his idea behind founding LUMS with the presence of all Deans and Directors representing Business Education at the conference. In the closing ceremony Syed Babar Ali, Founder and Chancellor LUMS was given a standing ovation by Dr. Hasan Sohaib Murad, Chairman NBEAC. Chairman NBEAC acknowledged his lifelong services in the field of Business education and said that there is indeed no match to him. There is no parallel to him. He shall remain unique in terms- of his services.















Platinum Sponsor



Gold Sponsor



Silver Sponsors



Marketing Partner



Online Marketing Partner

